

Criteria Cards and Rubrics: Tools for Formative and Summative Assessment

A Presentation by
Carolyn Coil

E-mail: carolyncoil@piecesoflearning.com

Pieces of Learning, 1990 Market Road, Marion, IL 62959

Phone: 1-800-729-5137 Fax: 1-800-844-0455

Publisher's website: www.piecesoflearning.com Carolyn's website: www.carolyncoil.com

Website for Carolyn's online courses: www.kdsi.org/carolyncoil

Formative Assessment

The process of accumulating information about a student's progress and understanding during a unit of work in order to make ongoing instructional decisions.

- Identifies students who have reached their learning goals (or grade level standards) after minimal instruction and/or time and can continue learning by doing more challenging work.
- Allows teachers to guide instruction in response to the knowledge and skills students demonstrate after they begin doing their work.
- Alerts teachers about the misconceptions some students may have about the subject area content or about their learning goals and academic expectations.
- Allows students to change and improve their work before turning it in for a final grade. This is particularly important for gifted students who may carelessly complete work or a project that does not reflect their best effort.
- Gives students descriptive feedback so they can see what they have achieved and how they might improve. With gifted students this can be approached with a sports analogy: "Have you exceeded your personal best?"

Summative Assessment is...

A means to determine a student's mastery of information, knowledge, skills, concepts, etc. after the unit or learning activity has been completed.

- Should parallel the formative assessments that were used during the learning process. Should not be a mystery to students.
- May determine an exit grade or score and can be tied to a final decision about a student. Should encourage gifted students to meet challenging, advanced learning standards and do rigorous work.
- Should align with instructional/curricular objectives, standards and benchmarks.
- May be a form of alternative assessment; doesn't always have to be a test.

Developing Assessment Criteria

Nearly all student projects, products and performances could be assessed in a multitude of different ways. It is up to the teacher to *look at the standards* and then *determine the significant learning outcomes* for each piece of student work. This provides a focus and direction for the student and gives the teacher a concrete way to assess what each student does. These outcomes can be differentiated for gifted students to focus on higher level thinking and in-depth learning.

The first step is to decide on the assessment criteria you want to use for each product or performance your students do. Sometime you will use these to develop a simple assessment checklist. At other time these will become the criteria for your rubrics. Ask yourself:

- ✓ What standards are we working on and can they be extended for gifted students?
- ✓ ***“Can I picture what I want this product to look like?”*** If you can, developing assessment criteria is merely putting the picture into words.

Example
Make a collage of 20th century inventions

Standards/Learning outcomes:

Criteria for assessment:

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4.
- 5.
- 6.
- 7.
- 8.
- 9.
- 10.

Product Criteria Cards

You may have the same generic criteria for certain products or performances regardless of the specific academic content they cover. When this is the case, consider developing criteria cards to use every time students do the same type of product.

Product Criteria Card

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4.

PRODUCT CRITERIA CARDS

<p>ABC Book</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Focuses on one topic or idea 2. Has at least one word and picture about the idea from every letter of the alphabet 3. One page per letter 4. Alphabetical order 5. Neat with correct spelling 	<p>Chart</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Has two or more sections divided by lines 2. Title and subtitles 3. Shows information clearly 4. Neat with correct spelling
<p>Blog</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Posted on a web page 2. Clearly stated writer's opinion on topic 3. Has supporting evidence and facts 4. Includes link to resources, pictures, or video 5. Correct grammar and spelling 6. Allows for comments from others 	<p>Collage</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Has a solid backing 2. Pictures/objects overlap 3. Title/labels spelled correctly 4. Visually attractive and neat 5. Pictures/objects relate to topic
<p>Brochure</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Pictures relate to topic 2. Attractive and neat layout 3. Folded with information on each panel 4. Neat and clear writing highlighting important points 5. Correct spelling 	<p>Comic Book/Comic Strip</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Frames in correct sequence 2. Tells story or idea through pictures 3. Characters/objects clearly drawn 4. Clear writing with correct spelling 5. Humor 6. Original and creative
<p>Business Letter</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Heading – your name, address and date 2. Inside address – recipient's name and address 3. Salutation 4. Body – main part of the letter 5. Closing and signature 	<p>Crossword Puzzle</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Each word intersects with another in at least one space 2. Correct spelling 3. Accurate definitions indicating across and down 4. Neatly and clearly done
<p>Cartoon</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Conveys a message 2. Clear writing with correct spelling 3. Neatly drawn 4. Humorous 5. Creative and original 	<p>Debate</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Observes allotted time 2. States opinion clearly 3. Backs up opinion with evidence from reliable sources 4. Respectful of other side; no name calling

Collage

1. All pictures overlap



2. Shows examples of the topic

3. Pictures are glued on a poster board or construction paper

4. Neat

Collage



1. Does your collage have a solid backing?
2. Is it visually attractive?
3. Are pictures well spaced or overlapped?
4. Do you have neat, legible labels and titles?
5. Are you using materials creatively?

Helpful Hints: Criteria Cards for Assessment in Primary Grades (K-3)

- Design product criteria cards with your students as you introduce each product.
- Make the language on the cards simple enough that is completely understandable to your students.
- Make your criteria cards on full sheets of paper and include a picture of the product as well as the criteria for the product.
- Post each of the criteria on the wall of bulletin board for easy reference.
- You might want to color-code the cards according to categories such as Visual, Written, Hands-on, Speaking, etc.

Helpful Hints: All Grade Levels

- Share criteria cards between grade levels. It is helpful to know which products students have learned how to do at a previous grade level.
- Ask gifted and other high ability students what they could add to each criteria card to make their products show additional higher level thinking.
- Write criteria cards clearly but in a general way so that they can be used with any content or subject.

Rubric - Chart of Character Traits: Greek God or Goddess and Famous Person Today

NAME:

DATE:

Standards/Outcomes:

1. Show understanding of how Greek mythology has made an impact on current thinking.
2. Analyze character traits of a character in a Greek myth.
3. Organize, write, and present ideas.

C R I T E R I A

	1	2	3	4	5 Extension
Identifies Greek god/goddess and famous person of today and lists similar character traits.	Identifies only god or goddess but not famous person. 1-2 character traits.	Identifies god/goddess and famous person and 1-2 character traits.	Identifies god/goddess and famous person and 3-4 character traits.	Identifies god/goddess and famous person and 5 or more character traits.	Everything in #4 PLUS identifies unusual/unique traits that both have.
Gives examples of each trait for both the Greek god/goddess and the famous person of today.	Has 1-2 examples for famous person or the god/goddess but not both.	Has 1-2 examples for famous person and the god/goddess.	Has 3-4 examples for famous person and the god/goddess.	Examples for each of the 5 or more traits for god/goddess and for famous person.	Gives little known examples; links traits of both in uncommon ways.
Indicates which traits are strengths and which are weaknesses.	Indicates strengths or weaknesses for 1-2 traits but doesn't explain why.	Indicates strengths or weaknesses for 1-2 traits and explains why.	Indicates strengths or weaknesses for 3-4 traits and explains why.	Explains each of the 5 or more traits as a strength or weakness and indicates why.	Explains each of the 5 or more traits as both a strength and a weakness and indicates why.
Follows Chart criteria card.	Has 1 item on criteria card.	Has 2 items on criteria card.	Has 3 items on criteria card.	Has all 4 items on criteria card.	Visually striking chart; extremely detailed and understandable.
Points					
Total points				Grade	